## OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL CITY OF JACKSONVILLE



# REPORT OF MANAGEMENT REVIEW

VEHICLE ACCIDENTS WITHOUT CITY OF JACKSONVILLE DRIVER CERTIFICATIONS

MATTHEW J. LASCELL INSPECTOR GENERAL **AUGUST 31, 2023** 

DATE ISSUED

"Enhancing Public Trust in Government Through Independent and Responsible Oversight"



### OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL CITY OF JACKSONVILLE

Matthew J. Lascell Inspector General

MANAGEMENT REVIEW CASE NUMBER: 2023-0046

"Enhancing Public Trust in Government Through Independent and Responsible Oversight"

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

In April 2023, the Office of Inspector General (OIG) issued Management Review #2023-0022 regarding drivers in City of Jacksonville (COJ) Departments, Independent Agencies, Constitutional Offices, and the Jacksonville Fire and Rescue Department (collectivity, hereinafter referred to as "Members") who participate in the risk management program under Chapter 128, Ordinance Code, in accordance with the Motor Vehicle Safety Policy, Executive Order No. 2018-02. Specifically, the Management Review focused on whether drivers in the COJ Departments and Members held COJ Motor Vehicle Operator Certifications (hereinafter referred to as "City Driver Certifications"), in accordance with Motor Vehicle Safety Policy, Executive Order No. 2018-02 from December of 2021 through December of 2022.

The Management Review found **214** drivers in COJ Departments and Members whose four-year City Driver Certifications were expired and had not been re-certified as of **December 2022** and **27** drivers in COJ Departments and Members whose temporary 30-day City Driver Certifications appeared to have expired, and they had not obtained their four-year City Driver Certifications as of **November 2022**.

In August 2023, the OIG obtained relevant records dated December 2021 through December 2022 from the COJ related to drivers assigned to business vehicles involved in vehicle accidents. Based upon this information, the OIG initiated a separate Management Review to ensure drivers in COJ Departments and Members held City Driver Certifications at the time of their vehicle accidents, in accordance with Motor Vehicle Safety Policy, Executive Order No. 2018-02.

As the data utilized for this review is archival, the OIG recognizes that the number of identified discrepancies may not be completely accurate as of this writing. These inaccuracies can be attributed to the fact that some identified employees do not utilize city-owned or personally owned vehicles to conduct city business, and some employees identified may no longer work for COJ Departments and Members.

The Management Review intends to ensure compliance with the appropriate policies and procedures. As a result of this review, and in conjunction with the Mayor's Office, Risk Management, and Department Safety and Certification Coordinators, these discrepancies are being remedied. Records are being reviewed for accuracy, and the importance of policy compliance is being reinforced throughout the workforce.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> City Driver Certifications are not the same as State Driver Licenses.

#### **ISSUE AND FINDING**

#### Issue:

Whether drivers in the COJ Departments and Members held City Driver Certifications at the time of their vehicle accidents, in accordance with Motor Vehicle Safety Policy, Executive Order No. 2018-02.

#### **Governing Directive:**

Motor Vehicle Safety Policy, Executive Order No. 2018-02.

#### **Finding:**

The following issues and areas of improvement were identified:

- The OIG identified employees who may have been drivers in COJ Departments and Members who did not have valid City Driver Certifications on the dates of their vehicle accidents from **December 2021 through December 2022**.<sup>2</sup>
- COJ Finance and Administration Department, Risk Management Division (Risk Management) confirmed that 16 employees in COJ Departments and Members were drivers who did not have valid City Driver Certifications on the dates of their vehicle accidents from December 2021 through December 2022.
- Risk Management confirmed that the 16 employees either have valid City Driver Certifications or are no longer employed as of **August 2023**.

#### Motor Vehicle Safety Policy, Executive Order No. 2018-02

#### **Repeal of Certain Executive Orders**

The Executive Order repeals Executive Order 2015-04 and applies to all City departments except the Jacksonville Fire and Rescue Department ("JFRD").

#### Section 1.01, Scope

The Independent Agencies, Constitutional Offices (as defined below), and JFRD (collectively, "Members") participating in the risk management program under Chapter 128, *Ordinance Code*, may voluntarily utilize this Executive Order for establishing driver safety protocols or, at their discretion, develop their own safety directives, policies, and procedures due to hazards unique to their operations. This Executive Order applies only to Public Drivers who operate Public Vehicles and Privately Owned Vehicles when a Privately Owned Vehicle is used in the course and scope of City business (collectively, "Motor Vehicles")...

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> This includes current drivers, former drivers, and drivers who were temporarily assigned to other COJ Departments or Members on the dates of their vehicle accidents.

#### **Section 1.06, Functions of Certification Coordinators**

The Certification Coordinators shall serve as liaisons to Risk Management in the oversight and administration of driver safety. Specific duties of the Certification Coordinator shall include but are not be [sic] limited to:

- a) Ensuring new employees submit City Driver Certification applications to Risk Management Division.
- b) Assisting in the scheduling and tracking of his or her employees' completion of the City approved safe driver course.
- c) Attending periodic Certification Coordinators meetings.
- d) Receiving and distributing City operator certification cards.
- e) Assisting in maintaining a tracking record of driver certifications and their renewal.

#### Section 3.01, Certification Required

Public Employees must acquire and maintain a City Driver Certification to operate a Motor Vehicle if either the Public Employee's job description specifically requires him or her to operate a Motor Vehicle or the City department or participating Member's operational policies require the Public Employee to drive regularly...

#### Section 3.02, Public Driver Certification Requirements

The City Safety Office is responsible for issuing all City Driver Certifications. In order to obtain a City Driver Certification, a Public Employee shall meet the following minimum requirements:

- a) 18 years of age or older;
- b) Possess a valid Driver License that shall not be under suspension or revocation by the respective State Department of Highway Safety and Motor Vehicles or by any court, or be the subject of any suspension or revocation proceedings;
- c) Have successfully passed the City's approved safe driving course no more than six (6) months preceding the application. Documentation of course completion is required and notification of such must be forwarded to the City Safety Office. If circumstances warrant, at the Senior Safety Officer's discretion, a temporary City Driver Certification can be issued until the Public Driver passes the approved safe driving course, provided the Public Driver meets all other selection criteria; and...

#### Section 3.04, Administration of the Certification Procedure

- a) Each City department and participating Member shall designate a Certification Coordinator.
- b) Each applicant must complete and sign a standardized "Application for City Driver Certification". The department/division Certification Coordinator will assist with the electronic submission of the application. The City Safety Office will verify Driver License status and inform Certification Coordinator to assign required course modules. Upon successful completion of all modules, City Safety Office will be notified and a certification card will be forwarded to the employee's Certification Coordinator for record update followed by presentation to the employee.
- c) A Public Driver shall complete and pass the City approved safe driving course once every four years.

#### Section 3.05, Certification Upgrade and Renewal

- a) To upgrade a license "class", the Public Driver must submit an electronic application for certification to the City Safety Office.
- b) Public Driver certifications shall expire every four years from date of issuance.
- c) The City department or participating Member's Certification Coordinator, along with the Public Driver, share the responsibility for requesting re-certification as a Public Driver.
- d) At least ten (10) business days prior to the expiration of the Public Driver's City Certification, the Certification Coordinator shall notify City of driver re-certification.
- e) The name listed on the Public Driver's Driver License shall match the name listed in the City's or the participating Member's official human resources personnel file.

#### Section 4.01, Requirement to Report an Accident

- a) Every Accident involving a Motor Vehicle shall be reported to JSO (if in Duval County) or to the local police department where the Accident occurs, regardless of the apparent property damage or resulting bodily injury. It is the responsibility of the Public Driver to ensure that the Accident is reported to his or her supervisor immediately to ensure proper investigation and documentation. Accident reporting forms should be available in the glove compartment of the Public Vehicle. Risk Management can provide vehicle accident reporting forms if there is not one immediately available or the Accident occurs while a Public Employee is operating his or her Privately Owned Vehicle. Unless for good cause, these forms shall be completed within the next business day and forwarded to the City Safety Office. A Supervisor Accident Investigation report shall be provided to Risk Management within 48 hours of the accident date.
- b) Any Public Vehicle involved in an Accident must be taken to Fleet Management for an estimate of repairs prior to continued use for City business. Vehicles shall not be repaired until a vehicle accident report, Supervisor's Accident Investigation report, and, if applicable, the police report is provided to Fleet Management.

#### **City Driver Certification and Vehicle Accident Records**

The following number of employees in the COJ Departments and Members were drivers who did not have valid City Driver Certifications on the dates of their vehicle accidents from **December 2021 through December 2022.**<sup>3</sup>

COJ Departments/Members	# of Drivers
Jacksonville Fire and Rescue	1*
Neighborhoods	1
Parks, Recreation and Community Services	2
Public Works	12
Total	16

<sup>\*</sup> A civilian employee.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The chart depicts the COJ Departments/Members that the drivers were employed with or assigned to on the date of the vehicle accidents based on Risk Management records.

#### RECOMMENDED CORRECTIVE ACTIONS

- 1. Ensure that drivers in COJ Departments and Members are issued four-year City Driver Certifications in a timely manner.
- 2. Ensure that drivers in COJ Departments and Members are not operating business vehicles or their personal vehicles for official business without valid City Driver Certifications.

#### **MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSE**

The OIG allowed Risk Management to submit a written explanation or rebuttal to the findings as stated in this investigative report within ten (10) calendar days.

In summary, Risk Management reviewed archived data based on the OIG's identified employees who may have been drivers in COJ Departments and Members who did not have valid City Driver Certifications on the dates of their vehicle accidents from December 2021 through December 2022. Based on Risk Management's review, they confirmed that 16 employees were drivers who did not have valid City Driver Certifications on the dates of their vehicle accidents from December 2021 through December 2022. Risk Management also determined that the employees requiring City Driver Certifications were currently certified or had terminated employment with COJ.

This report/review has been conducted in accordance with ASSOCIATION OF INSPECTOR GENERAL Principles and Quality Standards for Investigations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The OIG identified these employees based on a review of the historical and current records provided by Risk Management.